

Guidelines for Paper Critiques

While you read your papers, use the guidelines below to guide your critiques. You should read and critique the papers as if you were assigning them a letter grade.

General Guidelines

Citations

- Are references cited correctly and thoroughly?
- Are references cited frequently enough?
- Is enough said about cited research so that you can understand what's being cited and why?
- Is it clear when the author's ideas end and someone else's begin?
- Is the reference list formatted correctly and consistently?

General Writing Style

- Is writing concise?
- Is the **active** voice used as much as possible?
- Are points and arguments written clearly?
- Are transitions/segues smooth?
- Are the points of each paragraph clear? Do paragraphs have clear introductions and closings?

Editing

- Spelling
- Grammar

Section-specific Guidelines

Abstract

- Is the research summarized adequately?

Introduction

- Does the author go from a broad research question to a specific hypothesis?
- Is the hypothesis developed well?
 - With appropriate background research cited
 - With a clear rationale
- Are the variables clearly defined?

Methods

- Are methods explained in such a way that the study could be easily replicated?
- Do the methods follow a logical sequence?
- Do the methods include all appropriate information about participants, procedures, materials, etc.?

Results

- Do the results follow a logical order?
- Are figures cited appropriately?
- Are figure legends appropriate?
- Do verbal descriptions accompany numerical descriptions of data?
- Are data appropriately cited parenthetically?
- Are both inferential and descriptive statistics reported?

Discussion

- Are original hypotheses/findings summarized at the beginning of this section?
- Does the discussion wrap up the paper nicely?
- Does the discussion refer back to the research cited in the introduction?
- Does the author go from specific findings back to the general idea/research question?
- Does the author address strengths and limitations?
- Does the author address the generalizability of his/her results?

References

Figure Legends

Figures

Appendices